Effect of certified training facilities for intensive care specialists on mortality in Japan

Kazuto Yamashita, Hiroshi Ikai, Masaji Nishimura, Kiyohide Fushimi and Yuichi Imanaka

The impact of intensive care physicians on patient outcomes is widely debated. Critical care represents a large percentage of health care spending, and improving the quality of care in intensive care units is essential, given that medical needs will increase as the population ages rapidly. However, as of August 2011, Japan had only 878 critical care specialists certified by the Japanese Society of Intensive Care Medicine (JSICM; referred to as “board-certified” intensivists) — only 0.3% of the total number of physicians.1 This suggests that the majority of patients who need intensive care are treated by non-board-certified physicians. JSICM certifies training facilities for intensive care specialists. According to their rules for certification,2 an ICU that is a certified facility (CF) has at least one board-certified intensivist. The question of whether more intensivists are needed must be addressed immediately, as intensivist training takes 5 to 10 years after graduation from medical school, and medical demand is estimated to peak in 2025 in Japan; however, it is difficult to answer this question, because few studies have investigated the impact of board-certified intensivists in Japan.

The purpose of our study was to investigate the impact of board-certified intensivists in Japan, using administrative data. The study was approved and registered by the Kyoto University Graduate School and Faculty of Medicine Ethics Committee.

Methods

Data source

Data were obtained from the Diagnosis Procedure Combination (DPC) database, which is the national administrative database of a casemix classification system for acute inpatient care, developed in Japan and used since 2003.3 The database consists of summarised clinical information and detailed health care claim data. Clinical information comprises key patient information on age, sex, primary diagnosis, comorbidities (as classified by the International Classification of Diseases, 10th revision), complications, surgeries, and the DPC code. The DPC code is a 14-digit code used for reimbursement, where the first two digits represent the 18 major diagnosis categories (MDC) comprising diseases that require the most medical resource expenditure. Health care claim data include detailed medical resources use, indexed in the original Japanese codes,4 including diagnostic tests, all surgical or interventional procedures, medications, and the specified hospitalisation fees.

Hospital selection

All hospitals in the DPC database with at least one patient admitted to the ICU were included in this study. A list of CFs was obtained from the JSICM website.5

Patient selection

From all patients who were discharged between 1 April 2008 and 31 March 2010 we selected patients who were admitted to an ICU at any point during their hospitalisation. To focus on adult intensive care, patients younger than 18 years of age were excluded.
Patient outcomes

We evaluated ICU mortality and hospital mortality and compared patients who were treated in CFs with those who were treated in non-CFs.

We evaluated the impact of CFs on mortality using a two-step analysis. First we generated two models using multivariate logistic regression to adjust for casemix. One model (model A) included the variables age, emergency admission, admission source, treatments carried out in the ICU, such as mechanical ventilation, renal replacement therapy, and use of vasopressors. The other model (model B) included primary diagnosis in addition to the variables in model A. The forced-entry method was used in both models. In model B, MDCs constituting more than 1% of the total cases were selected, and the MDC “circulatory system” was used as the reference category.

To check the discriminatory ability of the models, c statistics were calculated.

After calculating c statistics of the models, a binary variable was assigned to indicate the group to which the patient belonged. The c statistics of the models were calculated again.

Statistical analyses

Data were compared using the χ² test for categorical variables and the unpaired Student t-test for continuous variables. Data are expressed as mean (standard deviation [SD]) or number (%). P < 0.05 was considered significant. All statistical analyses were performed using SPSS 11.0J (SPSS Inc.).
Results
A total of 164,803 ICU admissions in 434 hospitals were identified, of which 5,266 cases (3.2%) were excluded because the patients were under 18 years of age. A total of 159,540 cases were included in our analysis.

A total of 50,875 patients in 125 hospitals were treated in CFs and 108,665 patients in 309 hospitals were treated in non-CFs. The two groups were not substantially different with respect to disease categories; however, a higher proportion of CF patients exhibited diseases and disorders of the circulatory system ($P < 0.001$) (Table 1).

The proportions of patients who needed special treatments in the ICU were higher in CFs than in non-CFs (Table 2). ICU mortality and inhospital mortality were slightly higher in non-CFs (ICU mortality: 4.7% in CFs, 5.3% in non-CFs; inhospital mortality: 9.9% in CFs, 10.6% in non-CFs).

Results of the logistic regression analysis are presented in Table 3. In the first step, both models exhibited a good discriminatory ability. In the second step, among CF-treated patients the odds ratios for ICU mortality were 0.78 in both models and the odds ratios for hospital mortality were 0.81 and 0.85 in models A and B, respectively.

Discussion
This is the first large-scale study to document the use of ICUs and focus on board-certified intensivists in Japan. According to the Ministry of Health, Labour and Welfare, 806 hospitals were equipped with ICUs in 2008; therefore, these data are from more than half (53.8%) of the ICUs in Japan. Among the patients who needed critical care in our study, admission to hospitals whose ICUs were certified as training facilities for intensive care specialists had a positive effect on patient mortality, after risk adjustment.

Administrative data are easier and less expensive to collect than clinical data and are increasingly used in a variety of specialties. However, whether administrative data are suitable for risk adjustment in critically ill patients is debatable. A comparison between the performance of a model based on clinical data (customised Simplified Acute Physiology Score [SAPS] II) with that of a model based on administrative data (customised hospital standardised mortality ratio) in a Dutch ICU population showed that the clinical data-based model outperformed the administrative data-based model, particularly for high-risk patients. On the other hand, a comparison between several models based on administrative data with three physiology-based scores (Acute Physiology and Chronic Health Evaluation [APACHE] II, SAPS II and SAPS III) concluded that the Charlson comorbidity index combined with other administrative data predicted short- and long-term mortality in ICU patients as effectively as the physiology-based scores. In Japanese ICUs that are not certified as training facilities, physiological scores are not available for all patients, because there are no critical care specialists or such requirements. In general, physiological scores, such as the Sequential Organ Failure Assessment (SOFA) score and APACHE II, are preferred for clinical decision making, standardising research and comparing the quality of patient care across ICUs. We adjusted for the difference in casemix using ICU treatments because in our view each treatment reflects the severity of illness. The SOFA score comprises six elements: respiratory, renal, hepatic, cardiovascular, haematological and neurological. The predictive power of each element has been reviewed previously. Entry criteria for each treatment vary somewhat between clinicians; some ICU treatments may be used as surrogates of the physiological score. For example, in the SOFA score, the use of mechanical ventila-
tion is about equivalent to a respiratory score of >2, the use of renal replacement therapy is equivalent to a renal score of 3, and the use of vasopressors is equivalent to a cardiovascular score of 2. The c statistics for our models were high. Therefore, the use of ICU treatments as risk-adjustment variables is one option for countries where physiological scores are unavailable for evaluating the quality of care in a critical care setting.

Suitable physician staffing in ICUs is widely debated. High-intensity ICU physician staffing has been shown to be associated with reduced hospital mortality. However, it has also been reported that patients managed by critical care physicians had higher hospital mortality than those who were not.

In our study, overall mortality was relatively low compared with that of other countries. An investigation of international variation in critical care services across North America and Western Europe found an inverse correlation between ICU beds per capita and hospital mortality. In the United States, less than one-third of patients admitted to the ICU are from an operating room or related sources. By contrast, in our study, about half of the patients in both groups were admitted to the ICU after a scheduled operation. Admission route has already been shown to be a risk factor for inhospital mortality, so casemix may explain the fact that overall mortality among ICU patients is relatively low in Japan considering the number of ICU beds. However, this fact raises a new question: where are the other patients who suffer from severe diseases and need to be treated in the ICU?

The reason why better outcomes were achieved in CFs is unclear from this study, but possible explanations include implementation of best clinical practices, such as evidence-based treatments for acute lung injury and sepsis; preven-

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 3. Multiple logistic regression analysis of inhospital and ICU mortality</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emergency admission</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Admission route</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Post scheduled surgery</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medical indication</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICU treatment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vasopressor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mechanical ventilation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Renal replacement therapy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nervous system</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Respiratory system</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Circulatory system</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Musculoskeletal system</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Endocrine and metabolic system</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kidney and urinary system</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female reproductive system</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Blood and immunological disorders</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Injuries, burns and poisoning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Others</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other diagnosis categories†</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Certified ICU, odds ratio (95% CI)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c statistic</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

ICU = intensive care unit. * P < 0.05. † Includes seven major diagnosis categories (eye; ear, nose, mouth and throat; skin and subcutaneous tissue; breast; congenital disease; paediatric disease; psychiatry), each of which consisted of less than 1% of total cases.
tion of ICU complications; the educational role of ICU staff; and quick responses to emergency situations.

Limitations
This study has several limitations. First, we did not consider the intensity of care provided by each physician, which may influence the result. The 24-hour availability of a consultant-level intensivist is considered ideal, but in Japan physicians were not present in 21% of ICUs. These variations in the intensity of care may decrease the effect. We used mortality as the outcome, but mortality alone is not sufficient to measure the quality of ICUs. Activities of daily living after hospital discharge, the care process and costs should be evaluated in the future.

Second, the administrative data included information on a calendar-day basis rather than an hourly basis. We were therefore unable to distinguish between death in the ICU and death in the ward immediately after ICU discharge. But these deaths appear to indicate poor quality of care, given that a significant rate of readmission to the ICU within 48 hours is considered to indicate suboptimal clinical care. Therefore, inclusion of these deaths in ICU mortality is not germane to our discussion.

Conclusion
In Japan, models that use administrative data to adjust for the casemix of ICU patients provide good discriminatory ability, and we have shown that ICUs that are certified as training facilities for intensive care specialists have a positive effect on mortality in Japan.

Competing interests
None declared.

Author details
Kazuto Yamashita, Intensivist
Hiroshi Ikai, Lecturer
Masaji Nishimura, Professor
Kiyohide Fushimi, Professor
Yuichi Imanaka, Professor
1 Department of Healthcare Economics and Quality Management, Kyoto University Graduate School of Medicine, Kyoto, Japan.
2 Department of Emergency and Critical Care Medicine, University of Tokushima Graduate School, Tokushima, Japan.
3 Department of Health Policy and Informatics, Tokyo Medical and Dental University, Tokyo, Japan.
Correspondence: imanaka-y@umin.net

References
16 Lilly CM, Zuckerman IH, Badawi O, Riker RR. Benchmark data from more than 240,000 adults that reflect the current practice of critical care in the United States. Chest 2011; 140: 1232-42.